



Pulmonary rehabilitation for patients with COPD during and after an exacerbation-related hospitalisation: back to the future?

To the Editor:


The European Respiratory Society (ERS) and American Thoracic Society (ATS) guideline on management of chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD) exacerbations was published in the March 2017 issue of the *European Respiratory Journal* [1]. Based on evidence syntheses, including meta-analyses, relevant evidence up to September 2015 was summarised and clinical recommendations for treatment of COPD exacerbations were formulated. These guidelines were endorsed by the ERS Executive Committee and approved by the ATS Board of Directors in December 2016.

These guidelines should provide the basis for rational decisions in the treatment of COPD exacerbations. Unexpectedly, however, this ERS/ATS Task Force made a conditional recommendation against the initiation of pulmonary rehabilitation during hospitalisation and a conditional recommendation in favour of starting pulmonary rehabilitation ≤ 3 weeks after hospital discharge. Moreover, the Task Force rated the quality of evidence for both conditional recommendations to be very low. We take the liberty to challenge these conditional recommendations as well as the assessment of the evidence relating to them. Indeed, there are multiple arguments to recommend the initiation of pulmonary rehabilitation during and (especially) directly after hospitalisation.

Patients with COPD report a broad spectrum of symptoms during exacerbations, including dyspnoea, depression and fatigue [2], which seem to be the basis of the extreme declines in physical activity during hospitalisations [3]. Additionally, comorbidities may flare up [4], and significant losses in quadriceps muscle strength [5], exercise tolerance [6] and health status occur during hospitalisation [7], which only partially recover with usual care after discharge [3, 5, 8]. In addition, it has been shown that patients with anxiety and depression have a doubled risk of short-term hospital re-admission [9]. Therefore, we strongly believe that there is a clear rationale to start early rehabilitative interventions during exacerbation-related hospitalisation of patients with COPD and to continue this after discharge. Importantly, the content of the integrated peri-exacerbation pulmonary rehabilitation programme (which is much more than physiotherapy alone) needs to be tailored to the patient's physical and psychological status [10].

Recent randomised controlled trials (RCTs) have shown that rehabilitative interventions initiated during patients' hospital stay prevent a decline in lower-limb muscle function, balance and exercise performance, and facilitates recovery afterwards [11–15]. These RCTs did not report serious adverse events. Starting early rehabilitation in the hospital setting is clearly also in line with international developments to encourage early rehabilitative interventions, which are safe and effective for patients with a spectrum of illnesses, even in mechanically ventilated, critically ill patients [16–19].

The current ERS/ATS Task Force concluded that pulmonary rehabilitation initiated during hospitalisation increased mortality [1]. This conclusion seems based solely on the study by GREENING *et al.* [20], who reported a significant difference in mortality at 12 months between the rehabilitative group (starting with a median of three rehabilitative sessions during a median 5-day hospital stay, followed by a 6-week unsupervised home-based programme supported by telephone consultations) and the usual care control group (who did receive daily physiotherapy during hospitalisation as per standard UK practice). As argued

 @ERSpublications
Healthcare professionals should educate COPD patients and recommend rehabilitation in the peri-exacerbation period <http://ow.ly/gaiC30eQIVE>

Cite this article as: Spruit MA, Singh SJ, Rochester CL, *et al.* Pulmonary rehabilitation for patients with COPD during and after an exacerbation-related hospitalisation: back to the future? *Eur Respir J* 2018; 51: 1701312 [<https://doi.org/10.1183/13993003.01312-2017>].

previously [21], the difference in mortality began >5 months after the completion of the intervention. While of concern, the difference does not clearly relate to the early rehabilitation intervention. Indeed, the per protocol analysis did not show a difference in mortality, suggesting that those who actually received the intervention were not those who came to harm [20]. Thus, it is questionable to base a conditional recommendation against the initiation of pulmonary rehabilitation during hospitalisation on a single trial and not on the entirety of evidence. Also, it is not entirely clear how the quality of the evidence relating to this recommendation was rated by the ERS/ATS Task Force [1], which led to very different conclusions on the quality of the evidence compared to the recently updated Cochrane review [22].

A conditional recommendation indicates that well-informed patients may make different choices regarding whether or not to have the intervention [1]. While such preference-sensitive decision making is most welcome, it should be noted that, unfortunately, patients with COPD are mostly unaware of the value of (peri-exacerbation) pulmonary rehabilitation programmes for their health outcomes [23]. Moreover, our anecdotal clinical experience shows that healthcare professionals who are uneducated in pulmonary rehabilitation are already using this ERS/ATS conditional recommendation to withhold an early rehabilitative intervention in the peri-exacerbation period from patients. Indeed, during the ERS School Course on Pulmonary Rehabilitation (April 2017 in Athens, Greece), multiple concerns were expressed by participants that their local physicians read the ERS/ATS guideline on management of COPD exacerbations and, in turn, did not refer for early pulmonary rehabilitation.

On December 8, 2016, PUHAN *et al.* [22] published an update of their Cochrane review entitled “Pulmonary rehabilitation following exacerbations of chronic obstructive pulmonary disease”, including 20 studies, and concluded that “Quality of life and exercise capacity were improved by rehabilitation, that the effect was substantially larger than the minimal important difference, and the quality of evidence according to GRADE was high. Results for hospital readmissions and mortality were diverse, with some studies showing that pulmonary rehabilitation reduced hospital admissions and mortality compared with usual community care (no rehabilitation), and other studies not showing such effects”. Based on the existing literature, we believe that the ERS/ATS Task Force should have made a strong recommendation in favour of starting pulmonary rehabilitation in the first weeks after hospital discharge, without the conditional reservation.

To conclude, pulmonary rehabilitation ambassadors around the world have promoted pulmonary rehabilitation in patients with COPD during and shortly after an exacerbation-related hospitalisation [10, 24], as this results in clinically relevant improvements in exercise performance, lower-limb muscle function, balance and quality of life compared to usual care [22]. Presently, >75% of current pulmonary rehabilitation programmes include those patients [25]. Obviously, we recognise the heterogeneity of effects on mortality and hospital re-admission, which should be monitored closely. As always, the specific content of the rehabilitation intervention in the peri-exacerbation period must be tailored carefully to the patient’s condition and needs. Nevertheless, given the current evidence, the basis for the ERS/ATS conditional recommendation against the initiation of pulmonary rehabilitation during hospitalisation is not clear. This recommendation is therefore likely to have adverse impact on the quality of care, and in turn, the physical and emotional function and quality of life of these patients. We believe this recommendation is potentially harmful for the further broadening of the scope of pulmonary rehabilitation and sets pulmonary rehabilitation back 15 years. Therefore, we would like to encourage healthcare professionals to educate their patients and recommend pulmonary rehabilitation in the peri-exacerbation period, as only 5–15% of hospitalised COPD patients are currently referred for early pulmonary rehabilitation [26]. The ERS and ATS should commit to undertake actions that will improve access to and pulmonary rehabilitation services for suitable patients, including those with an exacerbation-related hospitalisation [24].

Martijn A. Spruit^{1,2,3}, Sally J. Singh^{4,5}, Carolyn L. Rochester^{6,7}, Neil J. Greening⁸, Frits M.E. Franssen^{1,2}, Fabio Pitta⁹, Thierry Troosters¹⁰, Claire Nolan^{11,12}, Ioannis Vogiatzis¹³, Enrico M. Clini¹⁴, William D.-C. Man^{11,12}, Chris Burtin³, Roger S. Goldstein¹⁵, Lowie E.G.W. Vanfleteren^{1,2}, Klaus Kenn^{16,17}, Linda Nici^{18,19}, Daisy J.A. Janssen^{1,20}, Richard Casaburi²¹, Takanobu Shioya²², Chris Garvey²³, Brian W. Carlin²⁴, Richard L. ZuWallack²⁵, Michael Steiner²⁶, Emiel F.M. Wouters^{1,27} and Milo A. Puhan²⁸

¹Dept of Research and Education, CIRO+, Center of Expertise for Chronic Organ Failure, Horn, The Netherlands.

²Dept of Respiratory Medicine, Maastricht University Medical Centre, NUTRIM School of Nutrition and Translational Research in Metabolism, Maastricht, The Netherlands. ³REVAL – Rehabilitation Research Center, BIOMED – Biomedical Research Institute, Faculty of Medicine and Life Sciences, Hasselt University, Diepenbeek, Belgium. ⁴Centre for Exercise and Rehabilitation Science, University Hospitals of Leicester NHS Trust, Glenfield Hospital, Leicester, UK.

⁵School of Sport, Exercise and Health Sciences, Loughborough University, Loughborough, UK. ⁶Yale University School of Medicine, New Haven, CT, USA. ⁷VA Connecticut Healthcare System, West Haven, CT, USA. ⁸Centre for Exercise and Rehabilitation Medicine, University Hospitals of Leicester, Leicester, UK. ⁹Laboratory of Research in Respiratory

Physiotherapy, State University of Londrina, Londrina, Brazil. ¹⁰KU Leuven, Dept of Rehabilitation Sciences, Leuven, Belgium. ¹¹Harefield Pulmonary Rehabilitation and Muscle Research Laboratory, Royal Brompton and Harefield NHS Foundation Trust, London, UK. ¹²National Heart and Lung Institute, Imperial College London, London, UK. ¹³Dept of

Sport, Exercise and Rehabilitation, Northumbria University, Newcastle Upon Tyne, UK. ¹⁴University of Modena and Reggio Emilia, Dept of Medical and Surgical Sciences, Modena, Italy. ¹⁵Dept of Respiratory Medicine and Rehabilitation, University of Toronto, Ontario, Canada. ¹⁶Schoen Klinik Berchtesgadener Land, Schoenau, Germany. ¹⁷University of Marburg, Marburg, Germany. ¹⁸Providence VAMC, Providence, RI, USA. ¹⁹Brown University, Providence, RI, USA. ²⁰Centre of Expertise for Palliative Care, Maastricht UMC+, Maastricht, The Netherlands. ²¹Rehabilitation Clinical Trials Center, Los Angeles Biomedical Research Institute at Harbor-UCLA Medical Center, Torrance, CA, USA. ²²Dept of Physical Therapy, Akita University Graduate School of Health Sciences, Akita, Japan. ²³Pulmonary Rehabilitation and Sleep Medicine, University of California San Francisco, CA, USA. ²⁴Sleep Medicine and Lung Health Consultants, Pittsburgh, PA, USA. ²⁵St Francis Hospital Medical Center, Hartford, CT, USA. ²⁶Leicester Respiratory Biomedical Research Centre, Glenfield Hospital, Leicester, UK. ²⁷Dept of Respiratory Medicine, Maastricht UMC+, Maastricht, the Netherlands. ²⁸Epidemiology, Biostatistics and Prevention Institute, University of Zurich, Zurich, Switzerland.

Correspondence: Martijn A. Spruit, Dept of Research and Education, CIRO, Hornerheide 1, 6085 NM Horn, The Netherlands. E-mail: martijnspruit@ciro-horn.nl

Received: July 05 2017 | Accepted: Aug 08 2017

Conflict of interest: Disclosures can be found alongside this article at erj.ersjournals.com

References

- 1 Wedzicha JA, Miravittles M, Hurst JR, *et al*. Management of COPD exacerbations: a European Respiratory Society/American Thoracic Society guideline. *Eur Respir J* 2017; 49: 1600791.
- 2 Kessler R, Stahl E, Vogelmeier C, *et al*. Patient understanding, detection, and experience of COPD exacerbations: an observational, interview-based study. *Chest* 2006; 130: 133–142.
- 3 Pitta F, Troosters T, Probst VS, *et al*. Physical activity and hospitalization for exacerbation of COPD. *Chest* 2006; 129: 536–544.
- 4 Burt MG, Roberts GW, Aguilar-Loza NR, *et al*. Relationship between glycaemia and length of hospital stay during an acute exacerbation of chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. *Intern Med J* 2013; 43: 721–724.
- 5 Spruit MA, Gosselink R, Troosters T, *et al*. Muscle force during an acute exacerbation in hospitalised patients with COPD and its relationship with CXCL8 and IGF-I. *Thorax* 2003; 58: 752–756.
- 6 Carr SJ, Hill K, Brooks D, *et al*. Pulmonary rehabilitation after acute exacerbation of chronic obstructive pulmonary disease in patients who previously completed a pulmonary rehabilitation program. *J Cardiopulm Rehabil Prev* 2009; 29: 318–324.
- 7 Miravittles M, Ferrer M, Pont A, *et al*. Effect of exacerbations on quality of life in patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease: a 2 year follow up study. *Thorax* 2004; 59: 387–395.
- 8 Donaldson GC, Wilkinson TM, Hurst JR, *et al*. Exacerbations and time spent outdoors in chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 2005; 171: 446–452.
- 9 Dahlen I, Janson C. Anxiety and depression are related to the outcome of emergency treatment in patients with obstructive pulmonary disease. *Chest* 2002; 122: 1633–1637.
- 10 Spruit MA, Singh SJ, Garvey C, *et al*. An official American Thoracic Society/European Respiratory Society statement: key concepts and advances in pulmonary rehabilitation. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 2013; 188: e13–e64.
- 11 Troosters T, Probst VS, Crul T, *et al*. Resistance training prevents deterioration in quadriceps muscle function during acute exacerbations of chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 2010; 181: 1072–1077.
- 12 Torres-Sanchez I, Valenza MC, Cabrera-Martos I, *et al*. Effects of an exercise intervention in frail older patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease hospitalized due to an exacerbation: a randomized controlled trial. *COPD* 2017; 14: 37–42.
- 13 Borges RC, Carvalho CR. Impact of resistance training in chronic obstructive pulmonary disease patients during periods of acute exacerbation. *Arch Phys Med Rehabil* 2014; 95: 1638–1645.
- 14 Giavedoni S, Deans A, McCaughey P, *et al*. Neuromuscular electrical stimulation prevents muscle function deterioration in exacerbated COPD: a pilot study. *Respir Med* 2012; 106: 1429–1434.
- 15 Greulich T, Nell C, Koepke J, *et al*. Benefits of whole body vibration training in patients hospitalised for COPD exacerbations – a randomized clinical trial. *BMC Pulm Med* 2014; 14: 60.
- 16 Burtin C, Clerckx B, Robbeets C, *et al*. Early exercise in critically ill patients enhances short-term functional recovery. *Crit Care Med* 2009; 37: 2499–2505.
- 17 Zanotti E, Felicetti G, Maini M, *et al*. Peripheral muscle strength training in bed-bound patients with COPD receiving mechanical ventilation: effect of electrical stimulation. *Chest* 2003; 124: 292–296.
- 18 Schweickert WD, Pohlman MC, Pohlman AS, *et al*. Early physical and occupational therapy in mechanically ventilated, critically ill patients: a randomised controlled trial. *Lancet* 2009; 373: 1874–1882.
- 19 Nydahl P, Sricharoenchai T, Chandra S, *et al*. Safety of patient mobilization and rehabilitation in the ICU: systematic review with meta-analysis. *Ann Am Thorac Soc* 2017; 14: 766–777.
- 20 Greening NJ, Williams JE, Hussain SF, *et al*. An early rehabilitation intervention to enhance recovery during hospital admission for an exacerbation of chronic respiratory disease: randomised controlled trial. *BMJ* 2014; 349: g4315.
- 21 Janssen DJ, Schols JM, Wouters EF, *et al*. One-year stability of care dependency in patients with advanced chronic organ failure. *J Am Med Dir Assoc* 2014; 15: 127–132.
- 22 Puhan MA, Gimeno-Santos E, Cates CJ, *et al*. Pulmonary rehabilitation following exacerbations of chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev* 2016; 12: CD005305.
- 23 Cox NS, Oliveira CC, Lahham A, *et al*. Pulmonary rehabilitation referral and participation are commonly influenced by environment, knowledge, and beliefs about consequences: a systematic review using the Theoretical Domains Framework. *J Physiother* 2017; 63: 84–93.

- 24 Rochester CL, Vogiatzis I, Holland AE, *et al.* An Official American Thoracic Society/European Respiratory Society Policy Statement: Enhancing Implementation, Use, and Delivery of Pulmonary Rehabilitation. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 2015; 192: 1373–1386.
- 25 Spruit MA, Pitta F, Garvey C, *et al.* Differences in content and organisational aspects of pulmonary rehabilitation programmes. *Eur Respir J* 2014; 43: 1326–1337.
- 26 Jones SE, Green SA, Clark AL, *et al.* Pulmonary rehabilitation following hospitalisation for acute exacerbation of COPD: referrals, uptake and adherence. *Thorax* 2014; 69: 181–182.

Copyright ©ERS 2018

*From the authors:*

We thank M.A. Spruit and colleagues for their questions about our decisions regarding initiating pulmonary rehabilitation in patients with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD) exacerbations. Their main objection is the recommendation against initiating pulmonary rehabilitation during the patient's hospitalisation. We agree that the recommendation was based primarily on the finding of increased mortality (6-min walking test had statistically significant improvement and hospital readmission had non-statistically significant improvement) and that the trial led by GREENING *et al.* [1] contributed 389 out of 415 patients. We further agree that there is uncertainty about whether or not inpatient-initiated pulmonary rehabilitation is associated with increased mortality, particularly since the mortality difference emerged more than 5 months after hospital discharge in the study by GREENING *et al.* [1] and that the per protocol analysis in this study found no difference in mortality among those who actually received pulmonary rehabilitation *versus* the control group.

However, we believe the guideline panel's judgment is justified. Faced with the decision about whether to recommend for or against an intervention for which the only major clinical trial found increased mortality and no reduction in the re-exacerbation rate, and only a few subsequent analyses raised doubt about the finding, we elected to minimise the potential for harm by recommending against the intervention until further evidence becomes available to revisit the decision. When combined with a recommendation in favour of pulmonary rehabilitation within 3 weeks of discharge, the net effect of the recommendations is a mere delay of days to weeks in the interest patient safety.

M.A. Spruit and colleagues cite the results of a 2016 Cochrane systematic review and meta-analysis to support their concerns [2]. However, they fail to acknowledge that the Cochrane report also found substantial evidence of heterogeneity of treatment effects on hospital readmissions and mortality, and that the "reasons for diverse effects ... are not fully clear. Further studies should explore whether the extent of the rehabilitation program and the organization of such programs within specific healthcare systems (*e.g.* within the rehabilitation setting *versus* embedded in the continuum of care from hospital to home to outpatient care) determines the effects of rehabilitation after COPD exacerbations."

We agree with these conclusions in the Cochrane report and, in the European Respiratory Society/American Thoracic Society guideline [3], we advocated for further research: patients, clinicians and other decision-makers need adequately powered, well-designed randomised clinical trials to more clearly delineate the role of pulmonary rehabilitation in the peri-exacerbation period.

Kevin C. Wilson¹, Jerry A. Krishnan², Pawel Sliwinski³, Gerard J. Criner⁴, Marc Miravittles⁵, John R. Hurst⁶, Peter M.A. Calverley⁷, Richard K. Albert⁸, David Rigau⁹, Thomy Tonia¹⁰, Jørgen Vestbo¹¹, Alberto Papi¹², Klaus F. Rabe¹³, Antonio Anzueto¹⁴ and Jadwiga A. Wedzicha¹⁵

¹Dept of Medicine, Boston University School of Medicine, Boston, MA, USA. ²University of Illinois Hospital and Health Sciences System, Chicago, IL, USA; co-chair, representing the American Thoracic Society. ³2nd Dept of Respiratory Medicine, Institute of Tuberculosis and Lung Diseases, Warsaw, Poland. ⁴Dept of Thoracic Medicine and Surgery, Lewis Katz School of Medicine at Temple University, Philadelphia, PA, USA. ⁵Pneumology Dept, Hospital Universitari Vall d'Hebron, CIBER de Enfermedades Respiratorias (CIBERES), Barcelona, Spain. ⁶UCL Respiratory, University College London, London, UK. ⁷Institute of Ageing and Chronic Disease, University of Liverpool, Liverpool, UK. ⁸Dept of Medicine, University of Colorado, Denver, Aurora, CO, USA. ⁹Iberoamerican Cochrane Center, Barcelona, Spain. ¹⁰Institute of Social and Preventive Medicine, University of Bern, Bern, Switzerland. ¹¹Division of Infection,



@ERSpublications

Guideline recommendation against the initiation of pulmonary rehabilitation during hospitalisation was justified <http://ow.ly/ve2L30hiqop>

Cite this article as: Wilson KC, Krishnan JA, Sliwinski P, *et al.* Pulmonary rehabilitation for patients with COPD during and after an exacerbation-related hospitalisation: back to the future? *Eur Respir J* 2018; 51: 1702577 [<https://doi.org/10.1183/13993003.02577-2017>].

Immunology and Respiratory Medicine, The University of Manchester and Manchester University NHS Foundation Trust, Manchester, UK. ¹²Respiratory Medicine, Dept of Medical Sciences, University of Ferrara, Ferrara, Italy. ¹³Dept of Internal Medicine, Christian-Albrechts University, Kiel and LungenClinic Grosshansdorf, Airway Research Centre North, German Centre for Lung Research, Grosshansdorf, Germany. ¹⁴University of Texas Health Science Center and South Texas Veterans Health Care System, San Antonio, TX, USA. ¹⁵Airways Disease Section, National Heart and Lung Institute, Imperial College London, UK; co-chair, representing the European Respiratory Society.

Correspondence: Kevin C. Wilson, Dept of Medicine, Boston University School of Medicine, 10 Whitney Ave, Westwood, Boston, 02090 MA, USA. E-mail: kwilson@thoracic.org

Received: Dec 11 2017 | Accepted: Dec 12 2017

Conflict of interest: D. Rigau and T. Tonia act as methodologists for the European Respiratory Society. All other disclosures can be found alongside this article at erj.ersjournals.com

References

- 1 Greening NJ, Williams JE, Hussain SF, *et al*. An early rehabilitation intervention to enhance recovery during hospital admission for an exacerbation of chronic respiratory disease: randomized controlled trial. *BMJ* 2014; 8: 349.
- 2 Puhan MA, Gimeno-Santos E, Cates CJ, *et al*. Pulmonary rehabilitation following exacerbations of chronic obstructive pulmonary disease. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev* 2016; 12: CD005305.
- 3 Wedzicha JA, Miravitlles M, Hurst JR, *et al*. Management of COPD exacerbations: a European Respiratory Society/ American Thoracic Society guideline. *Eur Respir J* 2017; 49: 1600791.

Copyright ©ERS 2018