

From the authors:

We thank K. Shah and Z. Udawadia for their comment on the joint systematic review and meta-analysis of the role of interferon- γ release assays (IGRAs) for the diagnosis of active tuberculosis (TB) by the Tuberculosis Network European Trials Group (TBNET) and the European Centre for Disease Prevention and Control [1]. It was demonstrated that immunodiagnosis by tuberculin skin testing and conventional IGRAs performed on cells from the peripheral blood, *i.e.* the QuantiFERON[®]-TB Gold In-Tube (Cellestis, Carnegie, Victoria, Australia) and the T-SPOT[®].TB (Oxford Immunotec, Abingdon, UK) assays, has a limited role in the diagnosis of active TB. Although the sensitivities of both IGRAs in detecting active TB are higher than that of the tuberculin skin test, their sensitivities are not high enough to be used as rule-out tests for TB and their specificities are insufficient to distinguish active TB from latent infection with *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. This standpoint is also expressed in the new European Union guidance on the use of IGRAs in support of the diagnosis of TB [2].

In contrast, immunodiagnosis using mononuclear cells from bronchoalveolar lavage either by IGRA in the ELISPOT format [3–6] or by fluorescence-activated cell sorting analysis [7] is a promising method with a high sensitivity and specificity for the rapid discrimination of active TB *versus* latent infection with *M. tuberculosis*, particularly in cases of acid-fast bacteria sputum smear-negative pulmonary TB in countries with low TB incidence. However, more evidence is needed to further validate these findings.

Local immunodiagnosis from extraneous fluids by IGRAs has also been explored in extrapulmonary TB, *e.g.* in meningitis [8], pericarditis [9], peritonitis [10] and pleuritis [11]. Although the method is very sensitive, it was, using strict criteria for active infection, deemed not specific enough for the correct diagnosis of active pleural TB to be routinely recommended. Measurement of unstimulated interferon- γ in pleural effusions could be more accurate to distinguish TB from non-TB aetiologies in regions of high TB incidence [12].

It was not a subject of our systematic review and meta-analysis to evaluate other methods for the diagnosis of active TB than IGRAs. However, we agree with K. Shah and Z. Udawadia that measurement of adenosine deaminase (ADA) in pleural effusion could be considered as an inexpensive method for the diagnosis of tuberculous pleurisy. A recent meta-analysis including 63 studies aimed at estimating the diagnostic accuracy of ADA measurement in pleural effusion identified a sensitivity of 0.92 (95% CI 0.90–0.93) and a specificity of 0.90 (95% CI 0.89–0.91), demonstrating that it is a reliable alternative method for the rapid diagnosis of tuberculous pleurisy, especially when the pre-test probability for TB is high and healthcare resources are limited [13].

C. Lange*, M. Sester[#], G. Sotgiu[¶], C. Giehl⁺, E. Girardi[§],
A. Bossink^f, K. Dheda^{**}, R. Diel^{###}, J. Dominguez^{¶¶},
M. Lipman⁺⁺, G.B. Migliori^{§§}, J. Nemeth^{ff}, P. Ravn^{***},
S. Winkler^{####}, E. Huitric^{¶¶¶}, A. Sandgren^{¶¶¶¶}
and D. Manissero^{¶¶¶¶}

*Division of Clinical Infectious Diseases, Research Center Borstel, Borstel, [#]Dept of Transplant and Infection Immunology, Saarland

University, Homburg, ⁺European Research and Project Office GmbH – Eurice, Saarbrücken, ^{###}Dept of Pulmonary Medicine, Hanover Medical School, Hanover, Germany, [¶]Hygiene and Preventive Medicine Institute, Sassari University, Sassari, [§]National Institute for Infectious Diseases L. Spallanzani, Rome, ^{§§}WHO Collaborating Centre for TB and Lung Diseases, Fondazione S. Maugeri, Care and Research Institute, Tradate, Italy, ^fDept of Pulmonary Medicine, Diakonessenhuis, Utrecht, the Netherlands, ^{**}Lung Infection and Immunity Unit, Division of Pulmonology and University of Cape Town Lung Institute, Dept of Medicine, Cape Town, South Africa, ^{¶¶}Dept of Microbiology, Institut d'Investigació en Ciències de la Salut Germans Trias i Pujol, Ciber Enfermedades Respiratorias, Institutio de Salud Carlos III, Badalona, Spain, ⁺⁺Royal Free Hospital, London, UK, ^{ff}Universitätsspital Zuerich, Zurich, Switzerland, ^{***}University Hospital Herlev, Herlev, Denmark, ^{####}Dept of Internal Medicine, Division of Infectious Diseases and Tropical Medicine, Medical University of Vienna, Vienna, Austria, and ^{¶¶¶¶}European Centre for Disease Prevention and Control, Stockholm, Sweden.

Correspondence: C. Lange, Tuberculosis Centre Borstel, Division of Clinical Infectious Diseases, Medical Clinic, Parkallee 35, 23845 Borstel, Germany. E-mail: clange@fz-borstel.de

Statement of Interest: Statements of interest for A. Bossink, K. Dheda, R. Diel and P. Ravn can be found at www.erj.ersjournals.com/site/misc/statements.xhtml

REFERENCES

- 1 Sester M, Sotgiu G, Lange C, *et al.* Interferon- γ release assays for the diagnosis of active tuberculosis: a systematic review and meta-analysis. *Eur Respir J* 2011; 37: 100–111.
- 2 European Centre for Disease Prevention and Control. Use of Interferon- γ Release Assays in Support of TB Diagnosis. Stockholm, ECDC, 2011.
- 3 Jafari C, Ernst M, Kalsdorf B, *et al.* Rapid diagnosis of smear-negative tuberculosis by bronchoalveolar lavage enzyme-linked immunospot. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 2006; 174: 1048–1054.
- 4 Jafari C, Ernst M, Strassburg A, *et al.* Local immunodiagnosis of pulmonary tuberculosis by enzyme-linked immunospot. *Eur Respir J* 2008; 31: 261–265.
- 5 Jafari C, Thijsen S, Sotgiu G, *et al.* Bronchoalveolar lavage enzyme-linked immunospot for a rapid diagnosis of tuberculosis: a Tuberculosis Network European Trials Group study. *Am J Respir Crit Care Med* 2009; 180: 666–673.
- 6 Jafari C, Kessler P, Sotgiu G, *et al.* Impact of a *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*-specific interferon- γ release assay in bronchoalveolar lavage fluid for a rapid diagnosis of tuberculosis. *J Intern Med* 2011; [Epub ahead of print DOI: 10.1111/j1365-2796.201102378x].
- 7 Nemeth J, Winkler HM, Zwick RH, *et al.* Recruitment of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* specific CD4+ T cells to the site of infection for diagnosis of active tuberculosis. *J Intern Med* 2009; 265: 163–168.
- 8 Thomas MM, Hinks TS, Raghuraman S, *et al.* Rapid diagnosis of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* meningitis by enumeration of cerebrospinal fluid antigen-specific T-cells. *Int J Tuberc Lung Dis* 2008; 12: 651–657.

- 9 Biglino A, Crivelli P, Concialdi E, *et al.* Clinical usefulness of ELISPOT assay on pericardial fluid in a case of suspected tuberculous pericarditis. *Infection* 2008; 36: 601–604.
- 10 Kim SH, Cho OH, Park SJ, *et al.* Diagnosis of abdominal tuberculosis by T-cell-based assays on peripheral blood and peritoneal fluid mononuclear cells. *J Infect* 2009; 59: 409–415.
- 11 Losi M, Bossink A, Codecasa L, *et al.* Use of a T-cell interferon- γ release assay for the diagnosis of tuberculous pleurisy. *Eur Respir J* 2007; 30: 1173–1179.
- 12 Dheda K, van Zyl-Smit RN, Sechi LA, *et al.* Utility of quantitative T-cell responses *versus* unstimulated interferon- γ for the diagnosis of pleural tuberculosis. *Eur Respir J* 2009; 34: 1118–1126.
- 13 Liang QL, Shi HZ, Wang K, *et al.* Diagnostic accuracy of adenosine deaminase in tuberculous pleurisy: a meta-analysis. *Respir Med* 2008; 102: 744–754.

DOI: 10.1183/09031936.00071111